

Montana Small Schools Alliance
HONORING MONTANA'S FIRST PEOPLES

UNIT: Looking at Bias and the Big Hole Battle

AUTHOR: Michele Conners

SCHOOL AND COUNTY: Wisdom School in Beaverhead County

GRADE LEVEL: 7 & 8

INDIAN RESERVATION REFERENCED:

SUBJECT AREAS: Indian Education, Social Studies, Reading, Writing, and Art.

CONTENT STANDARDS ADDRESSED:

Social Studies Content Standard 4: Students demonstrate an understanding of the effects of time, continuity, and change on historical and future perspectives and relationships. Benchmarks 1, 2, 3, 6, and 7.

Reading Content Standard 4: Students interact with (select, read, and respond to) print and nonprint material and literary works, from various cultures, ethnic groups, traditions and contemporary viewpoints written by both genders for a variety of purposes. Benchmark 2.

Reading Content Standard 5: Students gather, analyze, synthesize, and evaluate information from a variety of sources, and communicate their findings in ways appropriate for their purposes and audiences. Students use literary works to enrich personal experiences and to connect to the broader world of ideas, concepts, and issues. Benchmark 3 and 5.

Writing Content Standard 5: Students recognize the structures of various forms and apply these characteristics to their own writing. Benchmark 2.

Art Standard 3: Students develop and refine arts skills and techniques to express ideas, pose and solve problems, and discover meaning. Benchmark 1 and 2.

ESSENTIAL UNDERSTANDINGS ABOUT MONTANA INDIANS:

Indian Education Essential Understanding 6: History is a story and most often related through the subjective experience of the teller. Histories are being rediscovered and revised. History told from an Indian perspective conflicts with what most of mainstream history tells us.

BIBLIOGRAPHY:

Brown, Dee. Bury My Heart at Wounded Knee. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1970: pgs 316-330.

Brown, Mark H. "The Joseph Myth" Montana: The Magazine of Western History Winter 1972, pg 17.

Dusenberry, Verne. "Chief Joseph's Flight Through Montana: 1877" The Montana Magazine of History Fall 1952: pgs 43-51.

Haines, Aubrey L. The Battle of the Big Hole. Helena, MT: Two Dot, 2007: pgs 51-137.

Henry, Ralph C. Our Land Montana: The Story of Our Treasure State. Helena, MT: State Publishing Company, 1963: pgs 171-172.

Lang, William L., and Rex C. Meyers. Montana: Our Land & People. Boulder, Colorado: Pruett Publishing Company, 1979: pg 81.

McWhorter, L.V. Yellow Wolf: His Own Story. Caldwell, Idaho: Caxton Press: 2000: pgs 112-161.

Thayer, Thomas N., and Shar L. Murphy. Billings, MT: Montana Speaks, Inc., 1999: pgs 73-75.

Primary Source quotes from the Battle of the Big Hole compiled by the staff of the Big Hole Battlefield National Park.

ESSENTIAL QUESTIONS:

1. What is bias?
2. Whose bias is reflected in history books?
3. How has bias in history books changed over the years?
4. What are the damaging effects of bias?
5. Can bias be eliminated?

What understandings are desired?

1. Looking at sources from a variety of points of view helps to eliminate bias.
2. History is revised over time.
3. Bias can be a destructive.
4. American Indians have been victims of significant bias against them in history books.

What key knowledge and skills will students acquire as a result of this unit?**Students will know:**

1. Key terms: bias, point of view, primary source, secondary source, and revisionist history.
2. Basic chronological facts about the Battle of the Big Hole.
3. The difference between an oral history and a written history.

Students will be able to:

1. Identify possible bias in a written or oral retelling of an event.
2. Analyze and interpret primary and secondary sources.
3. Write an essay that compares and contrasts two conflicting viewpoints of an historical event using information gathered from primary and secondary sources.
4. Respond to bias in a constructive manner.

Performance Tasks

1. Timeline: Students will complete a timeline of the events leading to, during, and after the Battle of the Big Hole.
2. Compare and Contrast Essay: After researching the Battle of the Big Hole students will write an essay comparing and contrasting the American Indian Version and the U.S. Soldier's versions of this battle.
3. Work of Art that shows student's interpretation of this historical event.

Student Self Assessment and Reflection

1. Student will blog on the topic "What do I know about the Battle of the

- Big Hole” before and after the unit.
2. Students will blog reflection pieces after some lessons about what they have learned.
 3. Students will evaluate their essay using the 6 traits.

Assessment Task Blue Print

Time Line

What understandings of goals will be assessed through this task?
Students will know basic chronological facts about the Battle of the Big Hole.

What criteria are implied in the standards and understandings regardless of the task specifics? What qualities must student work demonstrate to signify that standards were met?

1. Students will use a variety of sources.
2. Students will be able to organize historical events chronologically.

Through what authentic performance task will students demonstrate understanding?

Time Line – You will research the events surrounding and including the battle and place them on a time line. You are to use the information provided in the two articles you are given, from The Montana Magazine of History, and the book, Bury My Heart at Wounded Knee, as well as the pamphlet from the Big Hole Battlefield National Park.

By what criteria will student products and performances be evaluated?

1. All major events of the battle are included.
2. Clarity and neatness of the timeline.

Compare and Contrast Essay:

After researching the Battle of the Big Hole students will write an essay comparing and contrasting the American Indian Version and the U.S. Soldier’s versions of this battle.

What understandings or goals will be assessed through this task?

1. Looking at sources from a variety of points of view helps to eliminate bias.
2. History told from an Indian perspective conflicts with what most of mainstream history tells us.
3. Write using characteristics of different forms.

What criteria are implied in the standards and understandings regardless of the task specifics? What qualities must student work demonstrate to signify that standards were met?

1. A variety of sources from different viewpoints are cited in the research.
2. Some sources cited have been written by American Indians.
3. Multiple paragraph essay shows organization of a compare and contrast essay.

Through what authentic performance task will students demonstrate understanding?

Task Overview: We have read and viewed many sources telling us about the Battle of the Big Hole. Write an essay comparing and contrasting the Indians' versions of the battle and the soldiers' version. Your essay must include specific examples from the selections that we have read to illustrate your points. Your conclusion must state your opinion of what you think may have really happened. Finally, you must include a bibliography of your sources.

By what criteria will student products and performances be evaluated?

The essay:

Includes at least 3 differences and 3 similarities between versions, cites at least 2 sources for each side, for a total of at least 4 sources, shows the 6 traits of writing and includes examples from sources to illustrate points, and includes a conclusion that states the writer's opinion. A bibliography is included.

Work of Art:

What understandings or goals will be assessed through this task?

Use art materials, techniques, technologies, and processes to create specific responses. Communicate intended meaning based on their own ideas and concepts from other sources. Respond to bias in a constructive manner.

What criteria are implied in the standards and understandings regardless of the task specifics? What qualities must student work demonstrate to signify that standards were met?

1. The piece of art will communicate meaning based on the research that they have done.
2. The art will communicate the student's response.

Through what authentic performance task will students demonstrate understanding?

Response Project – You are to complete a response project that is either a piece of visual or performance art. The project should in some way express the view of either the soldiers or the Indians about the Battle of the Big Hole.

You may create a piece of visual art or perform a one person skit which you have written, or perform a soliloquy of a remembrance of one of the battle's participants.

Plan Learning Experiences:

1. Have students play a competitive team game. (Capture the Flag) Be sure the game is played until there is a clear winner, and a clear loser. Have the students write a short narrative describing what happened during the game and how they felt about it. Share the narratives with the class. Complete a Venn diagram that compares the winner essays and with the loser essays. Discuss why the versions of what happened might be different. As a group write a narrative that all can agree upon.
2. Introduce the essential questions and understanding. Give an overview of the unit and the performance tasks by which they will be evaluated. Have students blog about what they know about the battle at this time. Using their blog entries compile a class list of facts they know about the battle.
3. Review the organization trait from the 6 Traits writing and then, as a class evaluate the class essay written about the game. Discuss possible organizational patterns fro a compare and contrast essay.
4. Comparison Matrix. Explain that they will be researching the Big Hole Battle using 3 different Montana history textbooks, one from 1963, one from 1979, and our present textbook. They are to compare the books using the criteria provided on the matrix. (see handout) After completing the matrix discuss as a class. Have students write individual compare and contrast essay on the three books.
5. Time Line – Have students research the events surrounding and including the battle from the time line. In addition to the information they have from the history book accounts they should use articles from the Montana Magazine of History, read the account of the battle from the book, Bury My Heart at Wounded Knee.
6. Review T diagrams. Explain that in this assignment they will be using the diagrams to record similarities and differences between the Indian accounts of the battle and the soldiers' accounts of the battle. Using chapter 4 of the book, The Battle of the Big Hole, model the T diagram method. Assign chapters 5, 6, and 7 over several days. Then read chapters 9, 10, and 11 from Yellow Wolf: His Own Story. Add to the T diagrams.
7. Field trip to the Big Hole Battle Field.
8. Assign performance essay. Have students do a self evaluation using the rubric.

Name _____

Response Project Rubric

Project Description:

____ Your project clearly expresses a viewpoint of either the Indians or the soldiers.

Performance Piece

____ I can hear you and you are speaking clearly.

____ Your performance conveys the thoughts and emotions of the character you are portraying.

Visual Art

____ The piece of art shows effort.

____ The choice of media and use of art elements help express your viewpoint.

History Textbook Comparison Matrix

Characteristics	Our Land Montana	Montana: Our Land & People	Montana History	Similarities	Differences
1. Length of entry about the battle					
2. Number of soldiers killed.					
3. Number of Indians killed.					
4. Details about Nez Perce.					
5. Details about the soldiers.					
6. Bias detected in the article					